

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF OKLAHOMA**

STATE OF OKLAHOMA, )  
 )  
 Plaintiff, )  
 )  
 v. ) Case No. 05-cv-329-GKF(SAJ)  
 )  
 TYSON FOODS, INC., et al., )  
 )  
 Defendants. )

**STATE OF OKLAHOMA'S MOTION FOR  
LEAVE TO SERVE REBUTTAL EXPERT REPORTS**

Plaintiff, the State of Oklahoma ("the State"), respectfully moves this Court for leave to serve rebuttal expert reports to rebut certain opinions contained in the expert reports of the following of Defendants' experts: Dr. Samuel Myoda, Dr. Ron L. Jarman, and Dr. Billy Clay<sup>1</sup>

## I. Introduction

This past May the State produced 15 expert reports to Defendants. On December 1, 2008, Defendants disclosed the expert reports of thirteen experts. Within these expert reports are a number of opinions on subject matters not directly addressed by the State's experts in their respective expert reports or which are based on methods or data which the State has a right to rebut. In the event the Court allows Defendants to introduce evidence on these new subject matters, methods, or data at trial, the State would desire and is entitled to introduce rebuttal evidence via expert witnesses to rebut such evidence.

While the State will rebut other aspects of the defense case in its direct evidence (including expert opinion, lay fact testimony, documents, or otherwise) or in cross examination,

<sup>1</sup> The State has attempted to confer with counsel for Defendants but, because of the holiday, Defendants' counsel has been unable to advise if Defendants agree or disagree to the relief sought herein.

in the spirit of full disclosure in the discovery process, the State is seeking leave to file rebuttal expert reports to rebut certain opinions of the expert reports of the following of Defendants' experts: Drs. Myoda, Jarman, and Clay.<sup>2</sup> The State seeks leave to file the rebuttal expert report regarding Dr. Myoda thirty days after receiving (1) data requested of Defendants on December 19, 2008 and, (2) split samples of all samples taken by Defendants regarding Dr. Myoda's PCR analysis. The State seeks leave to file rebuttal reports regarding Drs. Jarman and Clay fourteen days after entry of an order granting leave to file such reports. This will provide plenty of time for Defendants to review these rebuttal expert reports and to conduct discovery about these rebuttal opinions prior to the start of trial.

## **II. Areas for which rebuttal expert reports are sought**

As noted above, Defendants disclosed thirteen expert witnesses on December 1, 2008. The State has diligently reviewed the reports of these thirteen expert witnesses. The State is not seeking leave to disclose a rebuttal expert report as to each of these expert witnesses. Rather, the State has been extremely judicious in selecting the areas for which rebuttal expert reports are sought. They are as follows:

### **A. Report of Dr. Samuel Myoda**

Dr. Myoda's expert report contains PCR analyses of the State's environmental samples and Defendants' environmental samples which are based on methods or data which the State has a right to rebut. The requested rebuttal expert report would explain, repel, contradict, and/or disprove Dr. Myoda's PCR analyses.

---

<sup>2</sup> Defendants are required to disclose additional expert reports in January, 2009. Depending on the content of these new reports, the State may seek leave to file one or more rebuttal expert reports, and the State reserves all rights to do so. Moreover, nothing in this motion is intended to otherwise circumscribe the State's right to offer other rebuttal evidence at trial.

### **B. Report of Dr. Ron L. Jarman**

Dr. Jarman's expert report contains analyses of phosphorus and fecal coliform loadings from point sources, overflows, biosolids and human populations which are based on methods or data which the State has a right to rebut. The requested rebuttal expert report would explain, repel, contradict, and/or disprove Dr. Jarman's loading analyses.

### **C. Report of Dr. Billy Clay**

Dr. Clay's expert report contains analyses of the relative contribution of phosphorus and bacteria of cattle and poultry waste which are based on methods or data which the State has a right to rebut. The requested rebuttal expert report would explain, repel, contradict, and/or disprove Dr. Clay's analyses.

## **III. Argument**

Without the benefit of any substantive argument on the issue, Magistrate Judge Joyner stated in his October 28, 2008 Opinion and Order, DKT # 1787, that "[t]here is no provision in the scheduling order for rebuttal expert reports by either side so none should be expected." However, "fundamental fairness requires that a party be permitted to introduce evidence to rebut inferences the jury can draw from the opposing party's evidence. The right of a party to present evidence to refute evidence of the other side is a matter of right, the denial of which is an error of law." 88 C.J.S. *Trial* § 195. "Rebuttal evidence may be introduced to explain, repel, contradict, or disprove an adversary's proof." *United States v. Kelley*, 187 Fed. Appx. 876, 888 (10th Cir. 2006). "When a party opens the door to a topic, the admission of rebuttal evidence on that topic becomes permissible. Permissible does not mean mandatory, however; the decision to admit or exclude rebuttal testimony remains within the trial court's sound discretion." *Tanberg v. Sholtis*, 401 F.3d 1151, 1166 (10th Cir. 2005) (citation omitted). In the context of expert opinion, it

necessary follows that the Court's task of exercising its discretion as to whether to allow rebuttal expert opinion evidence at trial would be greatly facilitated by having rebuttal expert reports to review. Moreover, Defendants' trial preparation would be aided by having advance notice of the scope of the State's intended rebuttal evidence by means of expert rebuttal reports. Accordingly, the State is now respectfully requesting leave to serve a limited number of rebuttal expert reports on a limited number of issues.

This request by the State is narrowly focused. The State has not asked for leave to serve rebuttal expert reports as to each and every one of Defendants' experts. It has carefully studied the expert reports it has received to date and exercised great restraint in order to minimize the number of rebuttal expert reports it is requesting. Granting leave to file these three rebuttal reports on the schedule proposed will give Defendants ample time before trial to familiarize themselves with these rebuttal reports. Finally, the important goals of fundamental fairness and full development of the factual record will be served by granting the State's request.

#### **IV. Conclusion**

WHEREFORE, for the reasons stated above, the Court should grant the State leave to serve the requested rebuttal expert reports.

Respectfully Submitted,

W.A. Drew Edmondson OBA # 2628  
ATTORNEY GENERAL  
Kelly H. Burch OBA #17067  
J. Trevor Hammons OBA #20234  
Daniel P. Lennington OBA #21577  
ASSISTANT ATTORNEYS GENERAL  
State of Oklahoma  
313 N.E. 21<sup>st</sup> St.  
Oklahoma City, OK 73105  
(405) 521-3921

s/Robert A. Nance

M. David Riggs OBA #7583  
Joseph P. Lennart OBA #5371  
Richard T. Garren OBA #3253  
Sharon K. Weaver OBA #19010  
Robert A. Nance OBA #6581  
D. Sharon Gentry OBA #15641  
David P. Page OBA #6852  
RIGGS, ABNEY, NEAL, TURPEN,  
ORBISON & LEWIS  
502 West Sixth Street  
Tulsa, OK 74119  
(918) 587-3161

Louis W. Bullock OBA #1305  
Robert M. Blakemore OBA 18656  
BULLOCK, BULLOCK & BLAKEMORE  
110 West Seventh Street Suite 707  
Tulsa OK 74119  
(918) 584-2001

Frederick C. Baker  
(admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Lee M. Heath  
(admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Elizabeth C. Ward  
(admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Elizabeth Claire Xidis  
(admitted *pro hac vice*)  
MOTLEY RICE, LLC  
28 Bridgeside Boulevard  
Mount Pleasant, SC 29465  
(843) 216-9280

William H. Narwold  
(admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Ingrid L. Moll  
(admitted *pro hac vice*)  
MOTLEY RICE, LLC  
20 Church Street, 17<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Hartford, CT 06103  
(860) 882-1676

Jonathan D. Orent  
(admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Michael G. Rousseau  
(admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Fidelma L. Fitzpatrick  
(admitted *pro hac vice*)  
MOTLEY RICE, LLC  
321 South Main Street  
Providence, RI 02940  
(401) 457-7700

Attorneys for the State of Oklahoma

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that on this 31<sup>st</sup> day of December, 2008, I electronically transmitted the above and foregoing pleading to the Clerk of the Court using the ECF System for filing and a transmittal of a Notice of Electronic Filing to the following ECF registrants:

W. A. Drew Edmondson, Attorney General	fc_docket@oag.state.ok.us
Kelly H. Burch, Assistant Attorney General	Kelly_burch@oag.state.ok.us
J. Trevor Hammons, Assistant Attorney General	trevor_hammons@oag.state.ok.us
Daniel P. Lennington, Assistant Attorney General	daniel.lennington@oag.ok.gov

M. David Riggs	driggs@riggsabney.com
Joseph P. Lennart	jlennart@riggsabney.com
Richard T. Garren	rgarren@riggsabney.com
Sharon K. Weaver	sweaver@riggsabney.com
Robert A. Nance	rnance@riggsabney.com
D. Sharon Gentry	sgentry@riggsabney.com
David P. Page	dpage@riggsabney.com
RIGGS, ABNEY, NEAL, TURPEN, ORBISON & LEWIS	

Louis Werner Bullock	lbullock@bullock-blakemore.com
Robert M. Blakemore	bblakemore@bullock-blakemore.com
BULLOCK, BULLOCK & BLAKEMORE	

Frederick C. Baker	fbaker@motleyrice.com
Lee M. Heath	lheath@motleyrice.com
Elizabeth C. Ward	lward@motleyrice.com
Elizabeth Claire Xidis	cxidis@motleyrice.com
William H. Narwold	bnarwold@motleyrice.com
Ingrid L. Moll	imoll@motleyrice.com
Jonathan D. Orent	jorent@motleyrice.com
Michael G. Rousseau	mrousseau@motleyrice.com
Fidelma L. Fitzpatrick	ffitzpatrick@motleyrice.com

MOTLEY RICE, LLC  
**Counsel for State of Oklahoma**

Robert P. Redemann	rredemann@pmrlaw.net
Lawrence W. Zeringue	lzingue@pmrlaw.net
David C. Senger	dsenger@pmrlaw.net
PERRINE, MCGIVERN, REDEMANN, REID, BARRY & TAYLOR, P.L.L.C.	

Robert E Sanders	rsanders@youngwilliams.com
Edwin Stephen Williams	steve.williams@youngwilliams.com
YOUNG WILLIAMS P.A.	
<b><u>Counsel for Cal-Maine Farms, Inc and Cal-Maine Foods, Inc.</u></b>	

John H. Tucker	jtucker@rhodesokla.com
Theresa Noble Hill	thill@rhodesokla.com
Colin Hampton Tucker	ctucker@rhodesokla.com
Leslie Jane Southerland	ljsoutherland@rhodesokla.com
RHODES, HIERONYMUS, JONES, TUCKER & GABLE	

Terry Wayen West	terry@thewestlawfirm.com
THE WEST LAW FIRM	

Delmar R. Ehrich	dehrich@faegre.com
Bruce Jones	bjones@faegre.com
Krisann C. Kleibacker Lee	kklee@faegre.com
Todd P. Walker	twalker@faegre.com
Christopher H. Dolan	cdolan@faegre.com
FAEGRE & BENSON, LLP	

Dara D. Mann	dmann@mckennalong.com
MCKENNA, LONG & ALDRIDGE, LLP	
<b>Counsel for Cargill, Inc. &amp; Cargill Turkey Production, LLC</b>	

James Martin Graves	jgraves@bassettlawfirm.com
Gary V Weeks	gweeks@bassettlawfirm.com
Paul E. Thompson, Jr	pthompson@bassettlawfirm.com
Woody Bassett	wbassett@bassettlawfirm.com
K. C. Dupps Tucker	kctucker@bassettlawfirm.com
BASSETT LAW FIRM	

George W. Owens	gwo@owenslawfirmnpc.com
Randall E. Rose	rer@owenslawfirmnpc.com
OWENS LAW FIRM, P.C.	

**Counsel for George's Inc. & George's Farms, Inc.**

A. Scott McDaniel	smcdaniel@mhla-law.com
Nicole Longwell	nlongwell@mhla-law.com
Philip Hixon	phixon@mhla-law.com
Craig A. Merkes	cmerkes@mhla-law.com
MCDANIEL, HIXON, LONGWELL & ACORD, PLLC	

Sherry P. Bartley	sbartley@mwsqw.com
MITCHELL, WILLIAMS, SELIG, GATES & WOODYARD, PLLC	

**Counsel for Peterson Farms, Inc.**

John Elrod	jelrod@cwlaw.com
Vicki Bronson	vbronson@cwlaw.com
P. Joshua Wisley	jwisley@cwlaw.com
Bruce W. Freeman	bfreeman@cwlaw.com
D. Richard Funk	rfunk@cwlaw.com
CONNER & WINTERS, LLP	

**Counsel for Simmons Foods, Inc.**

Stephen L. Jantzen	sjantzen@ryanwhaley.com
Paula M. Buchwald	pbuchwald@ryanwhaley.com
Patrick M. Ryan	pryan@ryanwhaley.com
RYAN, WHALEY, COLDIRON & SHANDY, P.C.	

Mark D. Hopson	mhopson@sidley.com
Jay Thomas Jorgensen	jjorgensen@sidley.com
Timothy K. Webster	twebster@sidley.com
Thomas C. Green	tcgreen@sidley.com
Gordon D. Todd	gtodd@sidley.com
SIDLEY, AUSTIN, BROWN & WOOD LLP	

Robert W. George	robert.george@tyson.com
L. Bryan Burns	bryan.burns@tyson.com
TYSON FOODS, INC	

Michael R. Bond	michael.bond@kutakrock.com
Erin W. Thompson	erin.thompson@kutakrock.com
KUTAK ROCK, LLP	

**Counsel for Tyson Foods, Inc., Tyson Poultry, Inc., Tyson Chicken, Inc., & Cobb-Vantress, Inc.**

R. Thomas Lay	rtl@kiralaw.com
---------------	-----------------



KERR, IRVINE, RHODES & ABLES

Jennifer Stockton Griffin  
David Gregory Brown  
LATHROP & GAGE LC  
**Counsel for Willow Brook Foods, Inc.**

jgriffin@lathropgage.com

Robin S Conrad  
NATIONAL CHAMBER LITIGATION CENTER

rconrad@uschamber.com

Gary S Chilton  
HOLLADAY, CHILTON AND DEGIUSTI, PLLC  
**Counsel for US Chamber of Commerce and American Tort Reform Association**

gchilton@hcdattorneys.com

D. Kenyon Williams, Jr.  
Michael D. Graves  
HALL, ESTILL, HARDWICK, GABLE, GOLDEN & NELSON  
**Counsel for Poultry Growers/Interested Parties/ Poultry Partners, Inc.**

kwilliams@hallestill.com  
mgraves@hallestill.com

Richard Ford  
LeAnne Burnett  
CROWE & DUNLEVY  
**Counsel for Oklahoma Farm Bureau, Inc.**

richard.ford@crowedunlevy.com  
leanne.burnett@crowedunlevy.com

Kendra Akin Jones, Assistant Attorney General  
Charles L. Moulton, Sr Assistant Attorney General  
**Counsel for State of Arkansas and Arkansas National Resources Commission**

Kendra.Jones@arkansasag.gov  
Charles.Moulton@arkansasag.gov

Mark Richard Mullins  
MCAFEE & TAFT  
**Counsel for Texas Farm Bureau; Texas Cattle Feeders Association; Texas Pork Producers Association and Texas Association of Dairymen**

richard.mullins@mcafeetaft.com

Mia Vahlberg  
GABLE GOTWALS

mvahlberg@gablelaw.com

James T. Banks  
Adam J. Siegel  
HOGAN & HARTSON, LLP

jtbanks@hhlaw.com  
ajsiegel@hhlaw.com

**Counsel for National Chicken Council; U.S. Poultry and Egg Association & National Turkey**

**Federation**

John D. Russell  
FELLERS, SNIDER, BLANKENSHIP, BAILEY  
& TIPPENS, PC

jrussell@fellerssnider.com

William A. Waddell, Jr.  
David E. Choate  
FRIDAY, ELDREDGE & CLARK, LLP  
**Counsel for Arkansas Farm Bureau Federation**

waddell@fec.net  
dchoate@fec.net

Barry Greg Reynolds  
Jessica E. Rainey  
TITUS, HILLIS, REYNOLDS, LOVE,  
DICKMAN & MCCALMON

reynolds@titushillis.com  
jraine@titushillis.com

Nikaa Baugh Jordan  
William S. Cox, III  
LIGHTFOOT, FRANKLIN & WHITE, LLC

njordan@lightfootlaw.com  
wcox@lightfootlaw.com

**Counsel for American Farm Bureau and National Cattlemen's Beef Association**

Also on this 31<sup>st</sup> day of December, 2008, I mailed a copy of the above and foregoing pleading to the following:

**David Gregory Brown**  
Lathrop & Gage, LC  
314 E. High Street  
Jefferson City, MO 65101

**Thomas C. Green**  
Sidley Austin Brown & Wood, LLP  
1501 K St. NW  
Washington, DC 20005

**Cary Silverman**  
**Victor E. Schwartz**  
Shook Hardy & Bacon LLP  
600 14<sup>th</sup> St. NW, Ste. 800  
Washington, DC 20005-2004

**J. D. Strong**

Secretary of the Environment  
State of Oklahoma  
3800 North Classen  
Oklahoma City, OK 73118

**Dustin McDaniel**

**Justin Allen**

Office of the Attorney General (Little Rock)  
323 Center Street, Suite 200  
Little Rock, AR 72201-2610

**Steven B. Randall**

58185 County Road 658  
Kansas, Ok 74347

**George R. Stubblefield**

HC 66, Box 19-12  
Proctor, Ok 74457

s/Robert A. Nance

Robert A. Nance